



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of Regina Williamson,
Assistant Personnel Director
(M0679D), Paterson

Examination Appeal

CSC Docket No. 2023-473

ISSUED: September 20, 2023

Regina Williamson appeals the decision of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Assistant Personnel Director (M0679D), Paterson.

The subject examination announcement was issued with a closing date of June 21, 2022. The examination was open to candidates, in pertinent part, who had graduated from an accredited college or university with a Bachelor’s degree, and three years of supervisory personnel experience, one year of which shall have included responsibility for a major public or private industry personnel program including review of classification problems and wage studies, handling personnel problems, and coordination of the training needs of the jurisdiction. A Master’s degree in Personnel Administration, Applied Psychology or other related fields from an accredited college or university could have been substituted for one year of indicated supervisory personnel experience. The appellant was determined to be ineligible as she was deemed to be below the minimum requirements in experience. It is noted that one eligible appeared on the resulting eligible list, which promulgated on August 18, 2022 and expires on August 17, 2025. The eligible list was certified twice, but no appointment has yet been made.

On her application, the appellant indicated possession of a Bachelor’s degree, and she listed the following positions: two positions as an Employee Benefits

Specialist with Paterson, two positions as an Employee Benefits Clerk with Paterson, a Senior Clerk Typist with Paterson, an Institutional Claims & Correspondence Specialist with Horizon Blue Cross/Blue Shield, and a Member Service Coordinator with Horizon Blue Cross/Blue Shield. The appellant did not indicate that she supervised staff in any of her positions. Thus, none of the appellant's experience was accepted, and she was found to be lacking three years of supervisory personnel experience, including one year of qualifying specific experience.

On appeal, the appellant maintains that she should be eligible based on the duties of her current position, her education, and her training. She states that she "thought that *experience* can be used in cases for *education* and vice versa," so she "included [her] time towards attending school for [her] Master's Degree and the lengthy supervisory skills over [her] work domain." The appellant further indicates that she directs and supervises others with matters regarding health insurance, specifically, three co-workers who seek information from her when needed. She submits that more than one employee within Paterson and in her department received "improved titles" and she is concerned about fairness.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.3(b)2 provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the open competitive examination announcement by the closing date. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-6.3(b) provides that the appellant has the burden of proof in examination appeals.

In order for experience to be considered applicable, it must have as its primary focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. *See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi* (MSB, decided June 9, 2004). A review of the appellant's application reveals that she does not meet the announced requirements. When an applicant indicates extensive experience in titles established under the State Classification Plan, it is appropriate to utilize the Job Specifications to determine the primary focus of the duties of incumbents serving in career service titles. The experience description for the subject examination requires supervisory personnel experience. The appellant's Civil Service titles are non-supervisory titles, and a review of the duties that the appellant listed for her various positions indicates that she was not performing supervisory duties while in any title, nor did she indicate that she supervised staff. In that regard, it is noted that supervisory experience includes responsibility for seeing that tasks assigned to subordinates are efficiently accomplished. It involves independent assignment and distribution of work to employees, with oral or written task instructions, and maintenance of the flow and quality of work within a unit in order to ensure timely and effective fulfillment of objectives. Supervisors are responsible for making available or obtaining materials, supplies, equipment, and/or plans necessary for particular

tasks. They provide on-the-job training to subordinates when needed and make employee evaluations based on their own judgment. They have the authority to recommend hiring, firing, and disciplining employees. *See In the Matter of Julie Petix* (MSB, decided January 12, 2005). *See also, In the Matter of Susan Simon and William Gardiner* (Commissioner of Personnel, decided September 10, 1997).

Moreover, the appellant did not indicate that she completed a Master's degree in Personnel Administration, Applied Psychology or other related field. Rather, she indicated completion of credits towards a Master's degree. It is noted that incomplete Master's degrees are not a substitute for experience. Regarding other employee advancements, the appellant has not provided any evidence of misapplication of Civil Service law or rules.

Therefore, an independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of Agency Services that the appellant did not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date is amply supported by the record. The appellant provides no basis to disturb this decision. Accordingly, the appellant has failed to support her burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 20TH DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2023

Allison Chris Myers

Allison Chris Myers
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Nicholas F. Angiulo
Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Regina Williamson
Kathleen Long
Division of Agency Services
Records Center